

1M//819411(039)

OXFORD

# Freedom of Religious Organizations

Jane Calderwood Norton



# Table of Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xi
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xvii
<b>1. Introduction</b>	1
1. Foundations of this Book	4
2. Foundations of Protection for Religious Freedom	12
<b>2. Membership</b>	29
1. Becoming a Member	29
2. Being a Member	45
<b>3. Employment</b>	67
1. Doctrine	67
2. A Theoretical Explanation	84
<b>4. Property Disputes</b>	99
1. Doctrine	99
2. Normative Considerations	107
<b>5. The Family</b>	127
1. Doctrine	129
2. Normative Considerations	141
<b>6. Goods and Services</b>	163
1. Doctrine	163
2. A Theoretical Explanation	171
<b>7. Conclusion</b>	191
1. Normative Considerations	192
2. A Suggested Approach	196
3. The Approach in England	211
<i>Bibliography</i>	219
<i>Index</i>	231

## Table of Cases

A (Security for Return to Jurisdiction), Re, [1999] 2 FLR 1	138
A v Watchtower Bible and Tract Society [2015] EWHC 1722 (QB)	65
Abbott v Sullivan [1952] 1 KB 189	30, 49
Academy Trust of Hasmonean High School (ADA2990, 17 October 2015)	39
Ahmad v United Kingdom (1981) 4 EHRR 126	74
AI v MT [2013] EWHC 100 (Fam)	131, 134, 136
Akau'ola v President of the Conference of the Methodist Church of New Zealand HC AKCP 183/SW01 (HC, 5 December 2001)	123
Al-Midani v Al-Midani [1999] 1 Lloyd's Rep 923	137, 138, 150
Arenz v Germany (Communication No 1138/2002, UN Doc CCPR/C/80/D/1138/2002) (24 March 2004)	31
Arrowsmith v UK App 7050/75 (1980)	173, 174
Aston Cantlow and Wilmcote with Billesley Parochial Church Council v Wallbank [2003] UKHL 37, [2003] 3 WLR 283	182
Attorney-General v Pearson 36 ER 135 (1817)	103
Baudler v Germany App no 38254/04 (6 December 2011)	54
Berrisford v Woodard Schools (Midland Division) Ltd [1991] IRLR 247	74
Bhatti v Bhatti [2009] EWHC 3506 (Ch)	137
Birmingham Mosque Trust Ltd v Alavi [1992] ICR 435	52, 70
Black v Wilkinson [2013] EWCA Civ 820, [2013] 1 WLR 2490	166, 167
Blake v Associated Newspapers Ltd [2003] EWHC 1960 (QB)	30, 51
Board of Governors of St Matthias Church of England School v Crizzle [1992] UKEAT 409, [1993] ICR 401	81
Bonaker v Evans (1850) 16 QB 162	49
Brett v Brett (1969) 1 All ER 1007	138
Bull v Hall [2013] UKSC 73; [2014] Eq LR 76	165, 166, 167
Bull v Hall and Preddy [2012] EWCA Civ 83; [2012] 1 WLR 2514	166
Burwell v Hobby Lobby Stores (2014) 134 S Ct 2751	3, 8, 179, 180
Capel v Child (1832) 2 Cr & J 558	49
Catholic Care (Diocese of Leeds) v Charity Commission for England and Wales [2010] EWHC 520 (Ch), [2010] PTSR 1074	170
Catholic Care (Diocese of Leeds) v Charity Commission for England and Wales CA/2010/0007, 26 April 2011, First-Tier Tribunal (Charity) General Regulatory Chamber	170, 171, 189
Catholic Child Welfare Society v Various Claimants [2012] UKSC 56	65
Charter v Race Relations Board [1973] AC 868	33, 183
Christian Institute and others, Re Judicial Review [2007] NIQB 66	180
Cohen v Baram [1994] 2 Lloyd's Rep 138	137
Company X v Switzerland (1979) 16 DR 85	180
Corp of the Presiding Bishop of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints v Amos (1987) 483 US 327	203, 204
Craigdallie v Aikman (1820) 4 ER 435	103
D'Aguilar v D'Aguilar (1794) 1 Hag Ecc 7730	137
Davies v Presbyterian Church of Wales [1986] ICR 280 (HL)	52, 53, 70, 100, 101

De Lange v Presiding Bishop of the Methodist Church of Southern Africa (726/13) [2014] ZASCA 151 (29 September 2014) .....	64
Dilworth v Lovat Highland Estates Ltd and Trustees for St Benedict's Abbey [1999] GWD 38–1840 .....	47
Diocese of Southwark v Coker [1998] ICR 140 .....	52, 70
Dockers Labour Club & Institute Limited v Race Relations Board [1976] AC 285 .....	33, 183
Donoghue v Poplar Housing & Regeneration Community Association Ltd & Anor [2001] EWCA Civ 595, [2001] 3 WLR 183 .....	183
Durrington Cemetery [2000] 3 WLR 1322 .....	51
E v The Governing Body of JFS & Anor [2008] EWHC 1535 (Admin), [2008] ELR 445 ...	17, 215
Edgar v Edgar (1980) 1 WLR 1410 .....	131
El Majjaoui and Stichting Touba Moskee v Netherlands App no 25525/03 .....	82, 92
EM(Lebanon) v Home Secretary [2008] UKHL 64, [2009] 1 AC 1198 .....	139
Eweida and others v United Kingdom App nos 48420/10, 59842/10, 51671/10, and 36516/10 (15 January 2013) .....	72, 74, 173, 174, 176
Eweida v British Airways Plc [2010] EWCA Civ 80 .....	10, 17, 74, 203
Fernandez-Martinez v Spain App no 56030/07 (12 June 2014) .....	32, 54, 55
Fisher v Keane (1878) 11 ChD 353 .....	48
Forbes v Eden (1867) LR 1 Sc & Div 468 (HL) .....	47, 100
G (Education: Religious Upbringing), Re, [2012] EWCA Civ 1233, [2013] 1 FLR 677 .....	158
General Assembly of the Free Church of Scotland v Overtoun [1904] AC 515 .....	103
Gill v Davies (1997) 5 Ecc LJ 131 .....	52, 101, 211
Gilmour v Coates [1949] AC 426 .....	100
Glasgow City Council v McNab [2007] IRLR 476 (EAT) .....	80
Goldsmith v Bromer (1798) 1 Hag Con 324 .....	136
Goodridge v Department of Public Health (2003) 798 NE 2d 941 (Mass) .....	147
Hall and Preddy v Bull [2011] EW Misc 2 (CC) .....	166
Halpern v Halpern [2008] QB 195 .....	131
Hasan and Chaush v Bulgaria (2002) 34 EHRR 55 .....	14, 31, 81, 146
Hasan v Redcoat Community Centre (2014) 16 Ecc LJ 115 .....	71
Hender v Prospects for People with Learning Disabilities (ET, 13 May 2008) .....	80, 187
Hofer v Hofer (1966) 59 DLR (2d) 723 (Man QB); aff'd (1967) 65 DLR (2d) 607 (Man CA); aff'd (1970) 13 DLR (3d) I (SCC) .....	114, 115
Holy Monasteries v Greece (1994) 20 EHRR 1 .....	180
Holy Synod of the Bulgarian Orthodox Church (Metropolitan Inokentiy) v Bulgaria App nos 412/03 and 35677/04 (2009) .....	19, 54, 55, 81, 91
Hosanna-Tabor Evangelical Lutheran Church and School v EEOC (2012) 132 S Ct 694 .....	3, 8, 92, 93, 203, 219
Hothi v Khella (CA, 20 May 1999) .....	49
Hyde v Hyde (1866) LR 1 P & D 130 .....	136
Innes v Wylie (1844) 1 Car & Kir 257 .....	48
Islamic Cultural Centre v Mahmoud App No UKEAT/0615/06/MAA (27 June 2007) .....	69
JGE v The Trustees of the Portsmouth Roman Catholic Diocesan Trust [2012] EWCA Civ 938 .....	65
JH Walker Ltd v Hussain [1996] IRLR 11 .....	81
Jivraj v Hashwani [2010] EWCA Civ 712, [2010] ICR 1435 .....	80, 137
Jivraj v Hashwani [2011] UKSC 40 (27 July 2011) .....	80, 137
John v Rees [1970] Ch 345 .....	49

Johns, R (on the application of) v Derby City Council [2011] EWHC 375 (Admin), [2011] 1 FLR 2094 .....	166
Jones v Wolf (1979) 443 US 595 .....	106, 111
Kalaç v Turkey (1997) 27 EHRR 552 .....	74
Karlsson v Sweden App no 12356/86; Spetz v Sweden App no 20402/92 .....	54
KC & NNC v City of Westminster v IC [2008] EWCA Civ 198, [2009] Fam 11 .....	139
Khan v Oxford City Mosque Society (EAT, 23 July 1998) .....	70
Khan v UK App no 11579/85 (ECtHR, 7 July 1986) .....	138
Knudsen v Norway App no 11045/84 .....	54
Kohn v Wagschal [2007] EWCA Civ 1022 (24 October 2007) .....	137
Kozak v Poland App 13102/02 [2010] ECHR 280 (2 March 2010) .....	170
Kustannus Oy Vapaa Ajatteliija AB v Finland (1996) 22 EHRR CD69 (European Commission) .....	179
Ladele v London Borough of Islington [2009] EWCA Civ 1357, [2010] 1 WLR 955 ...	72, 75, 166, 189, 203
Lakeside Colony of Hutterite Brethren v Hofer (1992) 97 DLR (4th) 17 (SCC) ...	115, 116, 123, 124
Law v National Greyhound Racing Club [1983] 1 WLR 1302 .....	30, 47
Lee v Ashers Baking Co Ltd & McArthur [2015] NICty 2 .....	173
Lee v Showmen's Guild of Great Britain [1952] 2 QB 329 .....	49
Leela Förderkreis E V v Germany, App no 58911/00 (6 November 2008) .....	161
Lindo v Belisario (1795) 1 Hag Con 216 .....	100, 136
London Borough Tower of Hamlets .....	157
Long v Bishop of Cape Town (1863) 1 Moore NS Cases 461 .....	46
Maharaj v Eastern Media Group Ltd [2010] EWHC 1294 (QB) .....	30, 51
Mandla v Dowell Lee [1983] 2 AC 548 .....	40, 41, 42, 81
Maples (formerly Melamud) v Maples [1988] Fam 14 .....	134
Marquess of Abergavenny v Bishop of Llandaff (1888) 20 QBD 460 .....	49
Mbuyi v Newpark Childcare (Shepherds Bush) Ltd [2015] ET 3300656/2014 .....	73
McClintock v Department of Constitutional Affairs [2008] IRLR 29 .....	71
McClure v Salvation Army (1972) 460 F 2d 553 (5th Cir) .....	92, 93, 203
McFarlane v Relate Avon Ltd [2010] EWCA Civ 880, [2010] IRLR 872 .....	72, 222
McInnes v Onslow-Fane [1978] 1 WLR 1520 .....	30
Metropolitan Church of Bessarabia v Moldova (2002) 35 EHRR 13 .....	14, 31, 91
Miroļubovs and Others v Latvia App no 798/05 (15 September 2009) .....	32, 55, 60
M'Millan v General Assembly of the Free Church of Scotland (the 'Cardross' case) (1861) 23 D 1314 ...	49
Moscow Branch of the Salvation Army v Russia App no 72881/01 (ECHR, 5 October 2006) .....	31, 37, 58
Motleib v Latif (CA, 3 November 1992) .....	49
Muhammed v The Leprosy Mission International (16 Dec 2009, ET/2303459/09) .....	80
Müller v Germany App no 12986/04 (6 December 2011) .....	54, 83
Nagle v Fielden [1966] 2 QB 633 .....	30
New Testament Church of God v Stewart [2007] EWCA Civ 1004; [2008] ICR 282 ...	58, 91, 146
Nolan v Russia App no 2512/04 (2009) .....	82, 92
O v O (Jurisdiction: Jewish Divorce) [2000] 2 FLR 147 .....	135
O'Neill v Governors of St. Thomas More RC School [1997] ICR 33 .....	74
Obst v Germany App no 425/03 (ECtHR, 23 September 2010) .....	74, 82
Ontario Human Rights Commission v. Brockie [2002] 22 DLR (4th) 174 .....	180
Pellegrini v Italy App no 30882/96 (ECtHR, 20 July 2001) .....	64, 138
Percy v Board of National Mission of the Church of Scotland [2005] UKHL 73, [2006] ...	53, 69, 70, 74, 100

Perry v Latvia App no 30273/03 . . . . .	82, 92
President of the Methodist Conference v Parfitt [1984] ICR 176 . . . . .	52, 70
President of the Methodist Conference v Preston [2013] UKSC 29, [2013] 2 AC 163 . . . . .	30, 53, 59, 70, 100
R (Amicus-MSF Section) v Secretary of State for Trade and Industry [2004] EWHC 860 (Admin) [2007] ICR 1176 . . . . .	77, 78, 94, 96
R (Datafin plc) v Panel for Takeovers and Mergers [1987] QB 815 . . . . .	49
R (E) v Governing Body of JFS and another (United Synagogue and others intervening) [2009] UKSC 15, [2010] 2 AC 728 . . . . .	30, 33, 39, 50, 144, 208
R (Gibbs) v Bishop of Manchester [2007] EWHC 480 . . . . .	52
R (Heather) v Leonard Cheshire Foundation [2002] EWCA Civ 366, (2002) 69 BMLR 22 . . . . .	183
R (on the application of Begum) v Governors of Denbigh High School [2006] UKHL 15, [2007] 1 AC 100 . . . . .	17, 74
R (Williamson) v Secretary of State for Education and Employment [2005] UKHL 15, [2005] 2 AC 246 [23] . . . . .	9, 10, 11, 17, 78, 87, 173, 174, 203, 211
R v Archbishop of Canterbury, ex p Morant [1944] KB 282 (CA) . . . . .	49
R v Archbishop of Canterbury, ex parte Williamson (10 March 1994) . . . . .	52
R v Archbishops of Canterbury and York, ex parte Williamson (CA, 1 March 1994) . . . . .	58
R v Beth Din, ex parte Bloom [1998] COD 131 . . . . .	46, 48, 53
R v Birmingham City Council, ex parte Equal Opportunities Commission [1989] AC 1155 . . . . .	40
R v Bishop of Stafford, ex parte Owen [2001] ACD 14 . . . . .	52
R v Chancellor of St Edmundsbury and Ipswich Diocese, ex parte White [1948] 1 KB 195 . . . . .	52
R v Chancellor of the Chichester Consistory Court, ex parte News Group Newspapers [1992] COD 48 . . . . .	52
R v Chief Rabbi of the United Hebrew Congregation of Great Britain and the Commonwealth, ex p Wachmann [1992] 1 WLR 1036 . . . . .	30, 48, 49, 50, 51, 53, 57, 60, 63, 78, 100
R v Dean and Chapter of St Paul's Cathedral and the Church in Wales, ex parte Williamson (1998) 5 Ecc LJ 129 . . . . .	46
R v Disciplinary Committee of the Jockey Club, ex parte Aga Khan [1993] 1 WLR 909 . . . . .	30, 47
R v Ecclesiastical Committee of Both Houses of Parliament, ex p The Church Society (1994) 6 Admin LR 670 . . . . .	102
R v Entry Clearance Officer, Bombay ex parte Amin [1983] 2 AC 818 . . . . .	183
R v Exeter Consistory Court, ex parte Cornish (1998) 5 Ecc LJ 212 (CA) . . . . .	52
R v Imam of Bury Park, ex parte Sulaiman [1994] COD . . . . .	30, 46, 48, 51, 53
R v North, ex p Oakey [1927] 1 KB 491 (CA) . . . . .	49
R v Secretary of State for Education and Science, ex parte Talmud Torah Machzikei Hadass School Trust (1985) The Times, April 12) . . . . .	158
R v Servite Houses, ex parte Goldsmith [2001] LGR 55 . . . . .	183
R v The Provincial Court of the Church in Wales, ex parte Reverend Clifford Williams (1999) 5 Ecc LJ 217 . . . . .	46
Radmacher (Formerly Granatino) v Granatino [2010] UKSC 42, [2010] 2 FLR 1900 . . . . .	131, 133
Reaney v Hereford Diocesan Board of Finance Case no 1602844/2006 (17 July 2007) . . . . .	77, 78
Reg v Rabbinical Commission, ex parte Cohen [1987] COD 1259 . . . . .	48
Roach v Hawthorne (Church of England Disciplinary Tribunal, 26 November 2014) . . . . .	64
Roberts v United States Jaycees (1980) 468 US 609 . . . . .	93
Russell v Duke of Norfolk [1949] 1 All ER 109 . . . . .	49
Russell v Russell (1880) 14 ChD 471 . . . . .	49
S (Abduction: Intolerable Situation: Beth Din), Re, [2000] 1 FLR 454 . . . . .	156
Sahin v Turkey App no 44774/98 (29 June 2004) . . . . .	74, 173
SAS v France, App no 43835/11 (1 July 2014) (Grand Chamber) . . . . .	148
Scandrett v Dowling [1992] 27 NSWLR 483 . . . . .	46, 136

Schüth v Germany App no 1620/03 (ECtHR, 23 September 2010) . . . . .	74, 82, 83
Seide v Gillette Industries Ltd [1980] IRLR 427 . . . . .	40, 81
Serbian Eastern Orthodox Diocese of America and Canada v Milivojevic (1976) 426 US 696 . . . . .	110
Sharpe v The Bishop of Worcester [2015] EWCA Civ 399 . . . . .	30, 70
Shergill v Khaira [2014] UKSC 33 . . . . .	30, 50, 100, 104, 118
Sheridan v Prospects for People with Learning Disabilities (ET, 13 May 2008) . . . . .	80, 187
Siebenhaar v Germany App no 18136/02 (ECtHR, 3 February 2011) . . . . .	74, 82, 83
Sindicatul Pastoralul Cel Bun v Romania App no 2330/09 (9 July 2013) [2013] ECHR 646 (Grand Chamber) . . . . .	32, 36
Singh (Santokh) v Guru Nanak Gurdwara [1990] ICR 309 . . . . .	52
Singh v Management Committee of the Bristol Sikh Temple [2012] UKEAT 0429 11 1402 (14 February 2012) . . . . .	70
Society of Locomotive Engineers and Firemen (ASLEF) v United Kingdom (2007) 45 EHRR 793 . . . . .	39
Soleimany v Soleimany [1999] QB 785 . . . . .	131, 137, 154
St John's with Holy Trinity, Deptford, Re, [1995] 1 WLR 721 . . . . .	102
St Margaret's Children and Family Care Society v Office of the Scottish Charity Regulator [2014] Scottish Charity Appeal Panel App 02/13 . . . . .	171
St Mary's, Barton upon Humber, Re, [1987] Fam 41 . . . . .	102
Svyato-Mykhaylviska Parafin v Ukraine App no 77703/01 (14 June 2007) . . . . .	31, 54
Syndicat Northcrest v Amselem [2004] 2 SCR 551 . . . . .	17, 25
Taylor v Kurtstag 2005 (7) BCLR 705 (W) . . . . .	39
Tyler v UK App no 21283/93 (Commission Decision, 5 April 1994) . . . . .	52, 64
Uddin v Choudhury & Ors [2009] EWCA Civ 1205 (21 October 2009) . . . . .	139
Ur-Rehman v Doncaster Jahia Mosque (Unfair Dismissal: Compensation) [2012] UKEAT 0117 12 1008 (10 August 2012) . . . . .	70
Varsani v Jesani (Cy-près) [1999] Ch 219 . . . . .	100, 105
Varsani v Jesani [2002] 1 P & CR DG 11 . . . . .	19, 105
von Colson v Land Nordrhein-Westfalen [1984] ECR 1891 . . . . .	76
Watson v Jones (1871) 80 US 679 . . . . .	92, 106, 108
Weinberger v Inglis (No 2) [1919] AC 606 (HL) . . . . .	49
Williamson v the Archbishop of Canterbury and York (CA, 5th September 1996) . . . . .	51
Williamson v UK App no 27008/95 (Commission Decision, 17 May 1995) . . . . .	30, 52, 54, 81
Wood v Woad (1874) LR 9 Exch 190 . . . . .	48, 49
X (Ross) v United Kingdom App no 10295/82 (14 October 1983) [1983] 6 EHRR 558 . . . . .	174
X and the Church of Scientology v Sweden (1979) 16 DR 68 . . . . .	12, 14, 31, 180
X v Denmark (1976) 5 DR 157 . . . . .	54, 58, 74, 96
YL v Birmingham City Council [2007] UKHL 27, [2007] 3 WLR 112 . . . . .	183

## *Table of Legislation*

Arbitration Act 1996 . . . . .	131, 132, 136, 138, 154		
Arbitration and Mediation (Equality) Services Bill 2014–15 . . . . .	128, 129, 132, 152, 161		78, 84, 85, 86, 89, 94, 127, 147, 164, 165, 168, 169, 170, 171, 179, 183, 185, 189, 191, 209, 211, 212, 213
Charities Act 1993 . . . . .	99, 105, 121	Family Law Act 1986 . . . . .	134
Children Act 1989 . . . . .	131, 132, 133	Human Rights Act 1998 . . . . .	1, 12, 46, 69, 70, 125, 146, 182, 184, 219, 220, 228
Church of England Assembly (Powers) Act 1919 . . . . .	45, 101	Jewish United Synagogues Act 1870 . . . . .	48
Church of Scotland Act 1921 . . . . .	100	Marriage (Same Sex Couples) Act 2013 . . . . .	147, 168
Churches (Scotland) Act 1905 . . . . .	104	Marriage Act 1949 . . . . .	134, 156
Divorce (Religious Marriages) Act 2002 . . . . .	135, 138, 155	Matrimonial Causes Act 1973 . . . . .	131, 133, 135, 161
Employment Equality (Religion or Belief) Regulations 2003 . . . . .	71, 76, 77, 79, 80	Race Relations Act 1976 . . . . .	33, 40, 183
Employment Equality (Sexual Orientation) Regulations 2003 . . . . .	71, 76, 77, 80	Schools Standards and Framework Act 1998 . . . . .	76
Equality Act (Sexual Orientation) Regulations 2007 . . . . .	168, 172	Sex Discrimination Act 1975 . . . . .	74, 76
Equality Act 2010 . . . . .	3, 5, 7, 14, 32, 33, 34, 35, 40, 43, 45, 57, 69, 71, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77,	Slaughterhouses Act 1974 . . . . .	48
		(United States) Civil Rights Act 1964 . . . . .	92, 203